

Politics 4206g/9762g, Philosophy 9121b
Theories of Global Justice
Winter Term 2019-20
Instructor R. Vernon, SSC 4216, Office hours Monday 12-2.30 (+ by appointment.)

Introduction:

In the canonical works of political thought (i.e. Plato to Marx) justice is taken to be a requirement that applies between citizen and citizen and between citizen and state: that is to say, it is taken to be something that comes into play only within the borders of political societies. In terms of the long history of political thought, the emergence of the idea of *global* obligations is very recent – we may date it to the path-breaking work of Peter Singer and Charles Beitz (both of whom we read, in weeks 2 and 4). As one might expect, basic approaches are highly contested, and in the first part of this course we critically review five influential positions: Singer’s humanitarian rescue thesis, Pogge’s “harm principle” approach, Beitz’s liberal cosmopolitanism, Nagel’s statism, Miller’s nationalism: in each case we examine their views in light of a critical response. In the second part of the course we move on to discuss six of the issues that have divided global-justice theorists: the nature of imperialism, immigration policy, exploitation, crimes against humanity, collective punishment, and climate justice.

Evaluation:

Major essay (70%), due on last day of classes. Normally, an essay on one of the week’s topics, Each week, two required sources are listed. A third source is also listed as “supplementary,” and your essay must take account of that reading as well as the two required readings. I am very open to essay topics that depart from this model, by drawing on readings from different weeks, but you must discuss any such proposal with me.

Minor essay (15%), due in week 6. Email to me on Feb 26 before 6 p.m., and bring a paper copy to class on Feb 27. 5 pages double-spaced: two pages summarizing two of the general approaches that we have discussed, three pages explaining why you prefer one of the two. These short essays will form the basis of our open discussion of approaches in week 7.

Participation, (15%) which means (i) showing up every week with a 1-page (single-spaced – normal margins!) commentary on the readings that encapsulates their main points and raises a question for discussion, and (ii) contributing helpfully to the work of the seminar. Both (i) and (i) are subject to qualitative assessment, but any week in which you fail to attend with an acceptable written commentary will result in the loss of one full percentage point from the 15 available.

Week 1 (Jan 09): Introduction to the course

Part One: Big theories

Week 2 (Jan 16): Humanitarianism

Peter Singer, "Famine, Affluence and Morality," *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 1 (1972), 229-43
Neera Badhwar, "International Aid: When Giving Becomes a Vice," in E.F. Paul et al eds. *Justice and Global Politics*, Cambridge University Press, 2006, 69-101.

Supplementary: either Scott Wisor, "Against Shallow Ponds," *Journal of Global Ethics* 7 (2011), 19-32 [an IPE perspective], or Garrett Cullity, *The Moral Demands of Affluence*, Oxford University Press, 2004, chapter 8 [a moral philosophy perspective]

Week 3 (Jan 23): A global harm principle?

Thomas Pogge, "'Assisting' the Global Poor," in D. Chatterjee ed, *The Ethics of Assistance* Cambridge University Press, 2004, 260-88.
Mathias Risse, "Do We Owe the Global Poor Assistance or Rectification?" *Ethics & International Affairs* 19 (2005) 9-18.

Supplementary: Andrew Linklater, "The Harm Principle and Global Ethics," *Global Society* 20 (2006), 329-43.

Week 4 (Jan 30): Liberal cosmopolitanism

Charles Beitz, "Justice and International Relations," *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 4 (1975) 360-89.
David Miller, "Cosmopolitanism: A Critique," *Critical Review of International Social & Political Philosophy* 5 (2002), 80-85.

Supplementary: Kok-Chor Tan, *Justice Without Borders*, Cambridge University Press, 2004, chapter 5.

Week 5 (Feb 6): Statism

Thomas Nagel, "The Problem of Global Justice," *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 33 (2005), 113-47
Laura Valentini, "Coercion and Global Justice," *American Political Science Review* 105 (2011), 205-20

Supplementary: Charles Jones and Richard Vernon, *Patriotism*, Cambridge: Polity, 2018, chapter 4.

Week 6 (Feb 13): Nationalism

David Miller, *On Nationality*, Oxford University Press 1995, chapter 3
Robert Goodin, "What is so Special about our Fellow-Countrymen?" *Ethics* 98 (1988), 663-86

Supplementary: Jeff McMahan, "The Limits of National Partiality," in *The Morality of Nationalism*, edited by Robert McKim and Jeff McMahan, Oxford University Press 1997, 107-38.

[Feb 20 – reading week]

Week 7 (Feb 27) : An open discussion of approaches.

Week 8 (Mar 5): What's wrong with Colonialism?

Lea Ypi , "What's Wrong With Colonialism?" *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 41 (2013), 158-01.
Margaret Moore, "The Taking of Territory and the Wrongs of Colonialism," *Journal of Political Philosophy* 27 (2019), 87-106.

Supplementary: Christopher Morris, "What's Wrong with Imperialism?" *Social Philosophy and Policy* 23 (2006), 153-66.

Week 9 (Mar 12): Opening and closing borders

David Miller, *Strangers in Our Midst*, Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press, 2016, chapter 4.
Michael Humer, "Is There a Right to Immigrate?" *Social Theory and Practice* 36 (2010), 429-61.

Supplementary: Joseph Carens, *The Ethics of Immigration*, Oxford University Press 2013, chapter 2.

Week 10 (Mar 19): What (if anything) is wrong with exploitation?

Matt Zwolinski, "Sweatshops, Choice and Exploitation," *Business Ethics Quarterly* 17 (2007), 689-727.
Ruth Sample, *Exploitation*, Lanham: Rowman and Littlefield, 2003, chapter 1.

Supplementary: Robert Goodin, *Reasons for Welfare*, Princeton University Press, 1998, chapter 5.

Week 11 (Mar 26): Can individuals be held responsible for global crimes?

Richard Vernon, "What is Crime Against Humanity?" *Journal of Political Philosophy* 10 (2002), 231-49
Norman Geras, *Crimes Against Humanity*, Manchester University Press, 2011, chapter 2

Massimo Renzo, "Crimes Against Humanity and the Limits of International Law," *Law and Philosophy* 31 (2012), 443-76.

Week 12 (April 2): Can collectives be held responsible for global crimes?

Avia Pasternak, "The Distributive Effect of Collective Punishment," in Tracy Isaacs and Richard Vernon eds., *Accountability for Collective Wrongdoing*, Cambridge University Press, 2011.
Erin Kelly, "The Burdens of Collective Liability," in D.K. Chatterjee and D. Scheid eds., *Ethics and Foreign Intervention*, Cambridge University Press, 2003, 118-39.

Supplementary: Karl Jaspers, *The Question of German Guilt* [1947]. Eng. trans., New York: Fordham University Press, 2001, 21-75.

Week 13 (April 9): Responsibility for climate justice

Simon Caney, "Cosmopolitan Justice, Responsibility, and Global Climate Change," *Leiden Journal of International Law* 18 (2005), 747-75.

Jonathan Pickering and Christian Barry, ""On the Concept of Climate Debt," *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* 15 (2012), 667-85.

Henry Shue, "Subsistence Emissions and Luxury Emissions," *Law and Policy* 15 (1993), 39-59.