MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SENATE

November 14, 2003

The meeting was held at 1:30 p.m. in Room 1R40, Richard Ivey School of Business.

SENATORS: 81

T. Adams  R. Howse  K. Okruhlik
M-A. Andrusyszyn  I. Hramiak  S. Osborn
I. Baruss  E. Johanssen  G. Paola
L. Bowman  C. Jones  R. Parks
S. Brennan  W. Kennedy  A. Pearson
C. Brown  J. Kingston  N. Petersen
E. Cairns  R. Klassen  R. Rehan
M. Carroll  P. Klein  N. Rhoden
N. Crowther  D. Kneale  R. Secco
R. Darnell  M. Kreiswirth  A. Sells
P. Davenport  P. Kucherepa  N. Shupak
P. Dean  B. Laserson  S. Singh
R. Dix  G. Lee  P. Skidmore
J. Doerksen  M. Lennon  L. Ste. Marie
R. Dunn  F. Longstaffe  A. Steinman
D. Dutrizac  R. Lumpkin  J-L. Suarez
J. Etherington  S. Majhanovich  J. Tennant
C. Farber  A. Margaritis  B. Thompson
W. Flintoff  D. McCarthy  B. Timney
A. Forbes  L. Miller  D. Vaillancourt
J. Garnett  G. Moran  J. Van Fleet
J. Harrington  B. Morrison  T. Vandervoort
R. Harris  J. Nash  L. Vaughan
S. Hatibovic-Kofman  M. Ninness  L. Williams
J. Haywood-Farmer  J. Nisker  M. Wilson
N. Heapy  E. Noble  M. Witen
S. Hill  J. O’Brien  B. Wood

Observers: L. Gribbon, D. Jameson, K. McQuillan, A. Weedon, P. Yeoman

By Invitation: S. Jarrett.
Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the meeting of October 17, 2003, were approved as circulated.

Welcome to New Senators

On behalf of Senate, Dr. Davenport welcomed the newly elected and re-elected Senators.

REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT

The President reported on the Sarnia-Lambton Research Facility, Maclean’s Annual Rankings of Universities and the COU meeting with the new Minister, the Honourable Mary Anne Chambers. Slides used to highlight his presentation are attached as Appendix 1.

Sarnia-Lambton Research Facility

Professor Carroll asked if the University will spend money on the new research park and if so, how much money. Dr. Davenport reported that the University did not purchase land or buildings but will receive compensation for the managerial services provided by the University. Dr. Petersen confirmed that Western’s Research and Development Park will manage the facility as their Sarnia-Lambton Campus (SLC) and whatever revenue is generated by that particular enterprise will stay in that community. Western will not spend any funds on the enterprise. Western entered into a relationship that will achieve many objectives without any particular risks. The SLC will fund initiatives in the areas of industrial and contract research, academic outreach and professional development, and technology transfer and intellectual property commercialization. The SLC will have direct access to firms for research and development collaboration, pilot projects and graduate placements that fit with Western’s research priorities and strengths.

OPERATIONS/AGENDA COMMITTEE [Exhibit I]

Senate Membership - Faculty Constituencies

On behalf of the Operations/Agenda Committee, it was moved by A. Pearson, seconded by A. Margaritis,

That the following nominees be appointed to Senate to represent the constituencies shown for two-year terms (to October 31, 2005):

- Representing the Faculty of Arts: Christopher Brown (Classical Studies), Jeff Tennant (French)
- Representing the Richard Ivey School of Business: Robert Klassen
- Representing the Faculty of Graduate Studies: At Large: Nigel Crowther (Classical Studies/Arts)
- Representing the Faculty of Graduate Studies: Arts, Music, Social Science: Charles Jones (Political Science/Social Science)
- Representing the Faculty of Graduate Studies: Health Sciences, Medicine & Dentistry, Science: Tony Vandervoot (Physical Therapy/Health Sciences)
- Representing the Faculty of Graduate Studies: Interdisciplinary/Collaborative Programs: Shiva Singh (Biology)
Representing the Faculty of Health Sciences: Karen Danylchuk (Kinesiology) and Mary-Anne Andrusyszyn (Nursing)
- Representing the Faculty of Information and Media Studies: Carole Farber
- Representing the Faculty of Law: Syd Usprich
- Representing the Faculty of Music: Richard Parks (Music Theory and Composition)
- Representing the Faculty of Science: Rick Secco (Earth Sciences)
- Representing Brescia University College: Lorna Bowman (Religious Studies & Philosophy)
- Representing Huron University College: Nelson Heapy (Psychology)
- Representing the Faculty of Social Science: Tracey Adams (Sociology), Nancy Rhoden (History), and Bruce Morrison (Political Science)

CARRIED

S.03-189 Senate Membership: Representative from the General Community

It was moved by A. Pearson, seconded by P. Dean,

That Annabel Sells be elected to serve on Senate (term from November 1, 2003 - October 31, 2005) as representative of the General Community.

CARRIED

S.03-190 Nominating Committee Membership

The following were elected as Members on the Senate Nominating Committee:
L. Williams, E. Cairns (terms to November 2004); and S. Brennan, J. Garnett, and J. White (terms to November 2005).

The following were elected as Alternates on the Senate Nominating Committee: R. Dunn (term to November 2004) and M. Bartlett (term to November 2005).

S.03-191 Appointments Procedure for Senior Academic and Administrative Officers of the University

It was moved by A. Pearson, seconded by W. Flintoff,

That the composition of a selection committee for University Librarian – Section N, University Librarian - be amended by deleting (d) the Chair of the University Library Council given that the Library Council disbanded in 2002.

N. UNIVERSITY LIBRARIAN

Composition of Selection Committee

A committee to select a University Librarian shall consist of:

(a) the Provost & Vice-President (Academic), who shall be Chair
(b) the Vice-President (Research)
(c) the Dean of Graduate Studies
(d) the Chair of the University Library Council
(e) 2 members of the full-time library staff, one of whom must be a professional librarian, elected by the full-time library staff
(f) 2 members of faculty and 1 student, elected by Senate

CARRIED
It was moved by A. Pearson, seconded by A. Margaritis,

That the following Senate meeting dates for 2005 be approved, with all meetings to begin
Fridays at 1:30 p.m:  January 21, February 18, March 18, April 15, May 20, June 24,
September 23, October 21, November 18, December 9.

CARRIED

Senate was informed of the appointment to Senate of Jane Plas (BA ‘71) by the Alumni Association
for a term from November 1, 2003, to October 31, 2005.

As a result of a change in title of the Manager, Applicant Services, Office of the Registrar, the
observer membership on Senate and the ex officio non-voting membership on the Senate Committee
on Academic Policy and Awards will be revised:

FROM: Manager, Applicant Services, Office of the Registrar
TO: Manager, Undergraduate Recruitment and Admissions, Office of the Registrar

Senate attendance requirements as detailed in Section 26 of the
University of Western Ontario Act (detailed in Exhibit I). Senate attendance is reviewed by the
Operations/Agenda Committee from time to time, and the Committee is prepared to recommend to
Senate that a Senate seat be declared vacant should a pattern of absenteeism develop. Senators who
find they have a schedule conflict with Senate meetings may apply for a Leave of Absence from
Senate for the Period of conflict. In this case, an Alternate will be appointed in accordance with the
Senate policy for filling vacancies. If the conflict is unresolvable, resignation from Senate would be
appropriate in order that the constituency concerned be represented by a duly appointed replacement.

NOMINATING COMMITTEE [Exhibit II]

J. Dixon, F. Longstaffe and H. Lutfiyya were elected to the Selection Committee for the Dean of
Engineering.

L. McKechnie, L. Purdy, and B. Timney were elected to the Selection Committee for the Dean of
Law.
Selection Committee for University Librarian

X. Chen, D. Kneale and M. Ninness were elected to the Selection Committee for the University Librarian.

Board of Governors

S. Singh was elected to serve on the Board of Governors for a four-year term (November 15, 2003, to November 14, 2007).

Vice-Chair of Senate

A. Pearson was re-elected to serve as Vice-Chair of Senate (to November 2004).

Operations/Agenda Committee (OAC)

The following were elected to the Operations/Agenda Committee: B. Laserson, T. Adams, T. Percival-Smith (terms to November 2004); and S. Brennan, C. Jones, and W. Kennedy (terms to November 2005).

Honorary Degrees Committee

The following were elected to the Honorary Degrees Committee: L. Williams (term to November 2004), K. Fleming, T. Isaacs, H. Laschinger, and F. Longstaffe (terms to November 2005).

Senate Review Board Academic (SRBA)

J. Stokes was re-elected to serve as Chair of SRBA (term to November 30, 2004).

The following members of Faculty were elected to SRBA (terms to November 30, 2005): P. Allen, I. Baruss, P. Dean, M. Joanisse, M. Usselman.

The following undergraduate students were elected to SRBA (terms to November 30, 2004): C. Chapman, J. Duncombe, G. Lee, D. McKinlay, N. Son, A. Steiman.

The following graduate students were elected to SRBA (terms to November 30, 2004): M. Mendelsohn, S. Teetzel, L. Williams and J. Hendry.

Senate Committee on Academic Policy and Awards (SCAPA)

The following were elected to SCAPA: N. Shupak (graduate student), M. Wilson (undergraduate student) (terms January to December 2004); and M. Workentin, J. Doerksen, M. Milde, E. Singleton, J. Voogt (terms January 1, 2004 to December 31, 2005).

University Council on Animal Care (UCAC)

L. Capretz and P. Cain were elected to the University Council on Animal Care (terms to November 2005).
ACADEMIC POLICY AND AWARDS [Exhibit III]

S.03-206 Brescia University College: Certificate in Religious Education

Prior to Senate considering the recommendation regarding the Certificate in Religious Education, Dean Timney corrected the following typographical error: in the third line of the paragraph “Certificate in Religious Education”, the word “religions” should read “religion”. With that correction, on behalf of SCAPA, it was moved by B. Timney, seconded by M. Wilson,

That a Certificate in Religious Education, detailed in Exhibit III, item 1, be introduced in the Religious Studies and Philosophy Department at Brescia University College, effective September 1, 2003.

CARRIED

S.03-207 Wording of Degree Diplomas

It was moved by B. Timney, seconded by S. Singh,

That effective for Spring Convocation 2005, all Bachelor/Baccalaureate degree diplomas have the name of the Bachelor/Baccalaureate degree with the Honors Specialization, Major(s), or Specialization module earned by the student and “With Distinction”, if appropriate.

Asked why Minors modules are not included on degree diplomas, Dean Timney explained that because of the wide range of modular choices that will be available to students and the resulting complexity of the combinations, SCAPA determined that it will not be possible to list Minor modules earned by the student. Recording the many details of the modules on the Degree Diplomas will not only reduce their aesthetic appeal, but it is likely to increase the chance of errors on the Diplomas and possible delays, especially for the Spring Convocation, caused by extra processing time that will be required to prepare, review and print the Diplomas. Transcripts will document all of the information on the student’s record including full names of all modules completed and any specific award or distinction attained throughout the student’s time at Western.

The question was called and CARRIED.

S.03-208 New Modules: Major in Biochemistry; Major in Philosophy at Brescia University College

It was moved by B. Timney, seconded by E. Cairns,

That effective September 1, 2004, the new Major modules, detailed in Exhibit III, item 3, be approved:

SCIENCE
• Major in Biochemistry

BRESCIA
• Major in Philosophy

CARRIED
S.03-209  **BSc in Honors Medical Biophysics**

It was moved by B. Timney, seconded by J. Haywood-Farmer,

That effective September 1, 2003, the Honors Medical Biophysics programs be revised to reinstate the BSc Program in Honors Medical Biophysics that was removed from the calendar when the BMSc program was introduced.

CARRIED

S.03-210  **Annual Report of the Provost’s Undergraduate Program Review Committee**

Senate received for information the Report of the Provost’s Undergraduate Program Review Committee (PRC) detailed in Exhibit III, Appendix 1.

Mr. Kucherepa referred to the Review of the Honors Business Administration Program detailed on page 17, of Exhibit III, Appendix 1, where it states: “The reviewers suggested improving the financial model either on the revenue or cost side. Finally, the reviewers expressed the concern that the HBA tuition, even at the current level, could turn the program into an elite one that is not affordable by a large number of students.” Mr. Kucherepa stated that according to the review scholarships, awards and loan programs have not kept pace with increases in tuition. An option to consider to ensure accessibility is to lower costs. He asked if cost cuts to secure accessible tuition levels can be investigated.

Dr. Moran stated that the tuition fees for the HBA program have increased significantly in a short period of time and the issue of accessibility is a concern. Setting of deregulated tuition fees is initiated by the dean of the Faculty concerned. The real cost of delivering the HBA program is more expensive than the fees paid by the students. The HBA program is delivered in a way similar to the MBA, including restricted class size. The issue at Ivey is where to set the fee to obtain the right balance between the capacity to deliver the course and ensuring accessibility. Resources continue to be allocated to facilitate student access, including student scholarships and bursaries on the basis of need in the HBA program. The funds directed towards students in the HBA program continues to increase at a higher rate than other programs.

Mr. Kucherepa expressed his view that a further investigation of the cost structure at Ivey could be a positive step towards accessible education. Dr. Moran stated that this suggestion holds for any of Western’s programs and is a reasonable appeal that should be considered during the budgeting process.

S.03-211  **Annual Report on the Status of Reviews of Graduate Programs**

The Report on the OCGS Appraisal of Graduate Programs at The University of Western Ontario During the Third Cycle (1996/97 - 2002/03), detailed in Exhibit III, Appendix 2, was received for information.

S.03-212  **Report on Scholarships and Awards**

Senate received for information the terms of reference for the following new scholarships and awards for recommendation to the Board of Governors through the Vice-Chancellor:

Legal Aid Ontario Award (Faculty of Law)
Margaret Rand Memorial Award in Visual Arts (Faculty of Arts, Visual Arts)
Barry Connell Steers Scholarship (Faculty of Social Science)
UNIVERSITY PLANNING [Exhibit IV]

S.03-213

Non-Discrimination / Harassment Policy (S.03-161)

On behalf of SCUP, it was moved by G. Moran, seconded by L. Ste. Marie,

That the Senate provide its advice to the Board of Governors, through the Vice-Chancellor, with regard to the Non-Discrimination/Harassment Policy detailed in Exhibit IV, Appendix 1.

Dr. Moran provided an overview of the background information regarding the Non-Discrimination / Harassment Policy which was initially discussed at Senate on September 19, 2003 [see details in Exhibit IV]. The policy was sent back to SCUP for review in light of concerns raised at the time. Following review by legal counsel and SCUP, the recommendation before Senate at this meeting is unchanged from the version that was discussed by Senate in September. Dr. Moran explained that the policy is for the most part a restatement of the current law in Ontario: no principle of academic freedom can override provincial law. Introducing the issue of academic freedom in the Non-Discrimination/Harassment Policy would give the impression that Western’s commitment to an environment free of discrimination and harassment would be modified by Western’s commitment to academic freedom. Academic freedom and an environment that is free from harassment and discrimination are two important and independent values. The general consensus is that both of the values and commitments can exist independently and that both can be protected adequately without merging the two independent values. The existing Senate position on academic freedom speaks effectively and comprehensively Western’s commitment to the principle of academic freedom1 for all those in the Western community, consequently, there is no need to bring the issue of academic freedom into the policy on Non-Discrimination/Harassment.

Professor Carroll stated a unique feature of Section 6.03 is that this is the one section of the policy that is not found in the Ontario Human Rights Code. It is independent of the University’s legal obligations to meet the demands of that Code. Section 6.03 is related to academic freedom because it states that conduct or behaviour also constitutes harassment, whether or not it is based on the prohibited grounds of section 4.00, when it creates an intimidating, demeaning or hostile working or academic environment. The danger relates to the word “demeaning” and what it means. Statements could be made during a legitimate academic discussion on campus that some individuals, either in the general community or on campus might find to be demeaning. Some examples relate to religion. A lecture on religion could include the statement that religion promotes homophobia. Some religious individuals might find that statement to be demeaning to their religion and to them and thus actionable under the clause. Another recent example is found in the Gazette student newspaper where a cartoon makes fun of religion. Some individuals could find the cartoon demeaning and thus could be actionable under the clause. A statement should be added to this particular section affirming that nothing in the section should be construed as undermining Western’s commitment to academic freedom.

Dr. Moran acknowledged the concerns presented by Professor Carroll and agreed that sometimes ideas are expressed that make individuals uncomfortable, but amending the policy will not prevent such situations from occurring – where issues around harassment and discrimination and academic freedom intersect. If a complaint is lodged it would be handled under the appropriate policies. An appeal to academic freedom could be made given that Senate endorsed a policy on the rights and responsibilities of academic freedom.

1 http://www.uwo.ca/univsec/mapp/section1/mapp138.pdf
Dean Pearson maintained that an environment free of non-discrimination and harassment is absolutely central to a university’s work as is academic freedom. It is important to provide respect and tolerance in such a diverse community. The two values are the pillars around which a university community is built. Professor Carroll suggests ways in which a conflict could occur between two very important values, but Western’s system and structures are in place to adjudicate when legitimate conflicts arise. The UWOFA Collective Agreement contains a strong statement on academic freedom and includes a statement about faculty exercising their academic creativity in ways which are respectful of other members of the community. The Senate statement contains similar language about respect for the community. Dean Pearson advocated that the Non-Discrimination/Harassment Policy be sent to the Board as contained in Exhibit IV, Appendix 1, along with the University’s statement on Rights and Responsibilities on Academic Freedom and that the community work hard to ensure that in those cases when the two values might conflict ways to seek resolution are called upon.

Professor Lennon stated that no matter what is contained in a policy, it stands or fails on the process of adjudication. Professor Carroll agreed that the process of adjudication is important, but argued that nothing in the current document directs the individual in charge of adjudicating complaints made under the document towards academic freedom.

S.03-213a It was moved by M. Carroll, seconded by M. Lennon,

That Section 6.03 be amended to include the statement: “Nothing in this section shall be construed as undermining this University’s stated commitment to academic freedom.”

Professor Carroll stated that this amendment covers individuals who are not covered by a collective agreement, i.e., students, because students will be vulnerable to charges being laid under this policy. The intent behind the amendment is to protect the individuals who might be charged under this particular policy.

Dr. Moran pointed out that the proposed policy will not apply to members of the UWOFA bargaining unit because the non-discrimination/harassment article in the Collective Agreement applies to those faculty members.

Professor Carroll stated that for faculty the non-discrimination/harassment article and the academic freedom article are linked by virtue of being in the collective agreement. The collective agreement is a whole, not segmented into pieces. The two documents should be linked in an explicit way.

Dean Pearson reiterated that it is through the adjudication process that difficulties will be sorted out rather than including a blanket statement in the policy.

Mr. Ste. Marie stated a difficulty could exist for staff who are less comfortable defending a point of view in the face of someone who is able to put their perspective forward in a forceful way. Concern exists amongst staff relative to the liberty that is inherent with academic freedom in a university environment. The proposed amendment would make it more difficult for staff to question behaviour that should be questioned.

The question on the amendment was called and was DEFEATED

Asked about the independence of the Human Rights Officer (HRO) vis-à-vis a complaint involving a university administrative official, given that the University appoints the HRO, Ms. O’Brien
explained that the person is not charged with adjudicating whether there has been discrimination or
harassment, the person is charged with resolving the issue between the two parties.

The question on the main motion was called and CARRIED.

S.03-214  **Report on Entering Grades and First-Year Grades**

Dr. Moran, Provost & Vice-President (Academic), provided an oral report on the entering grades of
students entering first year in the fall of 2003 and of grades obtained by first year students in 2002-
03.  Slides used to highlight his presentation are attached as **Appendix 2**.

Professor Carroll observed the apparent difference in grading scales between the Faculties of Arts
and Social Science and expressed concern about how these differences may manifest themselves in
terms of the awarding of continuing scholarships.  Dean Okruhlik indicated her concern and her
intention to pursue this issue further within the Faculty.

S.03-215  **University Libraries’ Annual Report**

Ms. Garnett, University Librarian, gave a brief oral report on the University Libraries’ Annual
Report, detailed in Exhibit VI, Appendix 2.  Overhead slides used to highlight the presentation are
attached as **Appendix 3**.

S.03-216  **Senior Administrative Organization and Leadership of Information Technology Services at
Western**

A report on the Senior Administrative Organization and Leadership of Information Technology
Services at Western, detailed in Exhibit IV, Appendix 3, was received for information.

S.03-217  **Chairs, Professorships and Fellowships**

The terms of reference for the Rotman Canada Research Chair in Philosophy of Science (Exhibit IV,
item 4) was received for information.

**ANNUAL REPORTS**

S.03-218  **Senate Review Board Academic** (SRBA)

The Annual Report of the Senate Review Board Academic, detailed in Exhibit V, was received for
information.

Professor Carroll asked if, at a future Senate meeting, further details could be provided about the
appeal granted against the finding of a scholastic offence, without revealing names of students,
professors, or courses.  He observed that the case appears to be similar to “Case A” described in the
undeniably guilty of plagiarism got off because of a minor procedural error on the part of the
department chair.  The Secretary asked that Professor Carroll detail his request in writing.
S.03-219  **REPORT OF THE ACADEMIC COLLEAGUE** [Exhibit VI]

The report of the Academic Colleague on the 267th meeting of the Council of Ontario Universities, detailed in Exhibit VI, was received for information. Topics discussed at the meeting included the proposed tuition freeze, the double cohort, and “branding” the Ontario university degree.

S.03-220  **ANNOUNCEMENTS & COMMUNICATIONS** [Exhibit VII]

Announcements & Communications, detailed in Exhibit VII, were received for information.

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 3:45 p.m.

_________________________ _________________________
P. Davenport J.K. Van Fleet
Chair Secretary
President’s Report to Senate

- Sarnia-Lambton Research Facility
- Maclean’s Annual Rankings of Universities
- COU Meeting with New Minister

Dr. Paul Davenport
November 14, 2003

Sarnia-Lambton Research Facility

- County of Lambton purchased Dow Modeland Site through Community Development Corporation.
- City of Sarnia purchased adjacent lands for Business Park (214 acres).
- UWO Research Park Corporation will manage the facility as Sarnia-Lambton campus.

Chemical Valley Opportunities

- R & D Collaboration.
- Pilot Projects.
- Graduate Placements.
- Knowledge and Innovation with strong regional base.

Maclean’s Ratings

- Western #3 in Medical-Doctoral – tied with Queen’s
- Areas of strength
  - Students with 75% or higher
  - Proportion who graduate
  - Upper-year class sizes
  - Faculty with Ph.D.
  - Social Science and Humanities grants
  - Scholarships and Bursaries
  - Alumni support

Maclean’s and “University Report Card”

Western outstanding in:
- Academic quality
- Breadth of programs
- Libraries and computing
- Student support services
- Outstanding faculty
- Residence and campus life

Meeting with Minister

- COU Executive Heads met Hon. Mary Anne Chambers – November 12
- Briefing on key issues:
  - Enrolment growth and system capacity
  - Tuition fee policy
  - Infrastructure and new construction
  - Graduate education
  - Unfunded Students
  - Quality of Education
Western Libraries

Presentation to Senate
Joyce Garnett – University Librarian
jgarnett@uwo.ca
www.lib.uwo.ca

October 2003

Operational Plan Framework

- Information Resources
- Staff Resources
- Information Access
- Information Services
- Information Literacy
- Collaborative Partnerships

Information Resources

- 95% of the world’s accumulated knowledge is still in non-digital format
- Western Libraries: 7.6 million items in various physical formats
- 75% of scholarly journals are available online: 72% SSH; 83% STM
- Western Libraries: 30,000 e-journals
- scholarsportal.info (Ontario universities)

Staff Resources

- Western Libraries rated highly by students
  - G&M University Report Card
  - Survey of Graduating Students
  - Staff development a priority

Information Access

- Enabled by technology
- 24/7 access from on and off campus
- Self-service options
- Wireless networks in all libraries

Information Services

- Library as place
  - 2.6 million visitors to Western Libraries
  - Archives and Research Collections Centre (ARCC)
- Library as service provider
  - ASK US NOW: Virtual Reference Pilot
  - Assessment of needs, expectations and outcomes
  - Records management (Archives)
Information Literacy
- Information literacy: set of competencies related to the retrieval, analysis, evaluation and ethical application of information
- 18,000 student participants
- Goal: curriculum-embedded information literacy through librarian-instructor partnerships in course design and delivery

Collaborative Partnerships
- Alumni: onsite access to e-resources and special workshops
- Teaching Support Centre: EDO, ITS and Libraries
- Shared Catalogue: Brescia, Huron, King’s, St. Peter’s, resource centres
- London Public Library: “Innovative” and “Partners” software